

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
CORPUS CHRISTI DIVISION**

MARC VEASEY, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

RICK PERRY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:13-cv-193 (NGR)

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

TEXAS LEAGUE OF YOUNG VOTERS
EDUCATION FUND, *et al.*,

Plaintiff-Intervenors,

TEXAS ASSOCIATION OF HISPANIC
COUNTY JUDGES AND COUNTY
COMMISSIONERS, *et al.*,

Plaintiff-Intervenors,

v.

STATE OF TEXAS, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:13-cv-263 (NGR)

TEXAS STATE CONFERENCE OF NAACP
BRANCHES, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

NANDITA BERRY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:13-cv-291 (NGR)

BELINDA ORTIZ, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

STATE OF TEXAS, *et al.*,

Defendants

Civil Action No. 2:13-cv-348 (NGR)

**JOINT RESPONSE BY ALL PRIVATE PLAINTIFFS AND PLAINTIFF-
INTERVENORS IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL
NOTICE OF "A REVIEW OF THE OPERATIONS OF THE VOTING SECTION OF
THE CIVIL RIGHTS DIVISION"**

This Brief is submitted on behalf of all private Plaintiffs and Plaintiff-Intervenors ("Plaintiffs")¹ in these consolidated cases in opposition to Defendants' Request for Judicial Notice of "A Review of the Operations of the Voting Section of the Civil Rights Division" ("the

¹ The Plaintiffs joining in this brief are the Texas State Conference of NAACP Branches, the Mexican American Legislative Caucus of the Texas House of Representatives, the Texas Association of Hispanic County Judges and County Commissioners, Hidalgo County, the Texas League of Young Voters Education Fund, Imani Clark, Michelle Bessiake, Estela Garcia Espinosa, Lionel Estrada, La Union Del Pueblo Entero, Inc., Lydia Lara, Margarito Martinez Lara, Maximina Martinez Lara, Eulalio Mendez, Jr., Belinda Ortiz, Lenard Taylor, Marc Veasey, Floyd James Carrier, Anna Burns, Michael Montez, Penny Pope, Jane Hamilton, Sergio DeLeon, Oscar Ortiz, Koby Ozias, John Mellor-Crummey, Jane Doe, James Doe, the League of United Latin American Citizens ("LULAC") and Dallas County, Texas.

Report”) (ECF No. 272). This Court should deny Defendants’ Request because it appears to be an improper attempt to present an irrelevant and *ad hominem* challenge to the bona fides of counsel for the United States.

A. JUDICIAL NOTICE MAY BE TAKEN OF ONLY RELEVANT EVIDENCE AND THE REPORT IS IRRELEVANT

As a threshold matter, it is highly doubtful the Court may take notice of any factual assertions made in the Report under Federal Rule of Evidence 201. “[C]ourts generally cannot take notice of findings of fact from other proceedings for the truth asserted therein because these are disputable and usually are disputed.” *Taylor v. Charter Med. Corp.*, 162 F.3d 827, 830 (5th Cir. 1998). That principle has been applied to inspector general reports. *See, e.g., Cnty. of San Miguel v. Kempthorne*, 587 F. Supp. 2d 64, 78 (D.D.C. 2008) (“The Inspector General’s report is not the type of document about which there can be no reasonable dispute. The Court knows nothing about the investigative process which led to the report’s conclusions, and it cannot access the report’s validity or be assured that the former Deputy Assistant Secretary received adequate notice and the opportunity to be heard on its contents.”).

This Court need not address those Rule 201 questions, however. Even if judicial notice is proper under Rule 201, the Report and the assertions in the Report must meet the basic threshold of relevance, applicable to all proffered evidence. *See Vallot v. Cent. Gulf Lines, Inc.*, 641 F.2d 347, 351 (5th Cir. 1981) (affirming rejection of request for judicial notice because proffered evidence was not relevant). The Report bears no relevance to any issue in this case.

These consolidated lawsuits address whether SB 14, as enacted and implemented, violates Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act, 42 U.S.C. § 1973, and/or the Fourteenth or Fifteenth Amendments. As such, the evidence in this case will focus on the process leading to the enactment of SB 14 (including efforts to enact a photo ID requirement in several legislative

sessions, and any post-enactment legislative activity), whether SB 14 results in a denial or abridgement of the right to vote on account of race, color, or membership in a language minority group, and whether SB14 otherwise violates the right to vote. There is no claim against counsel representing any parties in these cases, and thus no claim against the Department of Justice, its Civil Rights Division, or its Voting Rights Section.

The Report as to which Texas seeks judicial notice was issued by the Office of the Inspector General, responding to allegations of political bias in DOJ's handling of investigations and cases relating to the Voting Rights Act under both the Bush and Obama Administrations. There are no facts mentioned in the Report relevant to SB 14, and, indeed, the issue of the photo ID law in Texas is never mentioned in the Inspector General's Report.

Plaintiffs fail to understand how it may be argued that any matter purportedly relating to the bona fides of opposing counsel is relevant to this litigation, and Plaintiffs are deeply troubled by Texas's effort to interject this question into this litigation. Plaintiffs respectfully request that this Court deny Defendants' Request for Judicial Notice.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Ezra Rosenberg
Ezra D. Rosenberg
Michelle Hart Yearly
DECHERT LLP
902 Carnegie Center, Suite 500
Princeton, New Jersey 08540-6531
ezra.rosenberg@dechert.com

Steven B. Weisburd
Amy L. Rudd
Lindsey Cohan
DECHERT LLP
500 W. 6th Street, Suite 2010
Austin, Texas 78701
lindsey.cohan@dechert.com

Wendy Weiser
Myrna Pérez
Vishal Agraharkar
Jennifer Clark
The Brennan Center for Justice at NYU Law School
161 Avenue of the Americas, Floor 12
New York, New York 10013-1205
wendy.weiser@nyu.edu
myrna.perez@nyu.edu
vishal.agraharkar@nyu.edu
jenniferl.clark@nyu.edu

Robert A. Kengle
Mark A. Posner
Sonia Kaur Gill
Erandi Zamora
Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law
1401 New York Avenue, N.W., Suite 400
Washington, D.C. 20005
mposner@lawyerscommittee.org
Clay Bonilla
Daniel G. Covich
The Law Offices of William Bonilla, P.C.
2727 Morgan Avenue
Corpus Christi, Texas 78405
claybonilla@hotmail.com
Daniel@bonillalaw.com

Gary Bledsoe
PotterBledsoe, L.L.P.
316 W. 12th Street, Suite 307
Austin, Texas 78701
garybledsoe@sbcglobal.net

Robert Notzon
The Law Office of Robert Notzon
1502 West Avenue
Austin, Texas 78701
Robert@NotzonLaw.com

Jose Garza
Law Office of Jose Garza
7414 Robin Rest Drive
San Antonio, Texas 98209
garzapalm@aol.com

Kim Keenan
Marshall Taylor
Victor Goode
NAACP
4805 Mt. Hope Drive
Baltimore, Maryland 21215
kkeen@naacpnet.org
mtaylor@naacpnet.org
vgoode@naacpnet.org

*Counsel for Plaintiffs Texas State Conference of NAACP Branches, Mexican American
Legislative Caucus of the Texas House of Representatives*

Christina A. Swarn
Ryan P. Haygood
Natasha M. Korgaonkar
Leah C. Aden
Deuel Ross
NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc.
40 Rector Street, 5th Floor
New York, New York 10006
cswarn@naacpldf.org
rhaygood@naacpldf.org
nkorgaonkar@naacpldf.org
laden@naacpldf.org
dross@naacpldf.org

Danielle Conley
Jonathan Paikin
Kelly P. Dunbar
Sonya L. Lebsack
Lynn Eisenberg
M. Hasan Ali
Richard F. Shordt
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006
danielle.conley@wilmerhale.com
jonathan.paikin@wilmerhale.com
kelly.dunbar@wilmerhale.com

Counsel for Plaintiff-Intervenors Texas League of Young Voters Education Fund et al.

Jose Garza
Law Office of Jose Garza
7414 Robin Rest Drive
San Antonio, Texas 78209
garzpalm@aol.com

Marinda van Dalen
Texas RioGrande Legal Aid, Inc.
531 East St. Francis Street
Brownsville, Texas 78529-5354
mvandalen@trla.org
Robert W. Doggett
Texas Rio Grande Legal Aid Inc
4920 North IH 35
Austin, Texas 78751
rdoggett@trla.org

Counsel for Plaintiff-Intervenors Estela Garcia Espinosa, Lionel Estrada, Roxsanne Hernandez, La Union Del Pueblo Entero, Inc. Lydia Lara, Margarito Martinez Lara, Maximina Martinez Lara, Eulalio Mendez, Jr., Belinda Ortiz, Lenard Taylor

Rolando L Rios
Attorney at Law
115 E Travis, Suite 1645
San Antonio, Texas 78205
rrios@rolandorioslaw.com

Counsel for Plaintiff-Intervenor Texas Association of Hispanic County Judges and County Commissioners

Preston Edward Henrichson
Attorney at Law
222 W. Cano
Edinburg, Texas 78539
preston@henrichsonlaw.com

Rolando L Rios
Attorney at Law
115 E Travis, Suite 1645
San Antonio, Texas 78205
rrios@rolandorioslaw.com

Counsel for Plaintiff-Intervenor Hidalgo County

Chad W. Dunn
K. Scott Brazil
Brazil & Dunn
4201 Cypress Creek Parkway, Suite 530
Houston, Texas 77068
chad@brazilanddunn.com
scott@brazilanddunn.com

J. Gerald Hebert
Campaign Legal Center
215 E Street, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20002
GHebert@campaignlegalcenter.org
Neil G. Baron
Law Office of Neil G. Baron
914 FM 517 W, Suite 242
Dickinson, Texas 77539
neil@ngbaronlaw.com

David Richards
Richards, Rodriguez & Skeith, LLP
816 Congress Avenue, Suite 1200
Austin, Texas 78701
daverichards4@juno.com

Armand G. Derfner
Derfner, Altman & Wilborn, LLC
575 King Street, Suite B
Charleston, South Carolina 29402
aderfner@dawlegal.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs Marc Veasey, Floyd James Carrier, Anna Burns, Michael Montez, Penny Pope, Jane Hamilton, Sergio DeLeon, Oscar Ortiz, Koby Ozias, John Mellor-Crummey, Jane Doe, James Doe, League of United Latin American Citizens (“LULAC”) and Dallas County, Texas

Luis Roberto Vera, Jr.
LULAC National General Counsel
The Law Offices of Luis Vera Jr., and Associates
1325 Riverview Towers, 111 Soledad
San Antonio, Texas 78205-2260
lrvlaw@sbcglobal.net

Counsel for LULAC

Craig M. Watkins
Dallas County District Attorney
Teresa G. Snelson
Chief, Civil Division
Dallas County District Attorney's Office
411 Elm Street, 5th Floor
Dallas, Texas 75202-4606
Teresa.Snelson@dallascounty.org

Counsel for Dallas County, Texas

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 13, 2014, I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing
via the Court's ECF system on all counsel of record.

/s/ Lindsey B. Cohan
Lindsey B. Cohan
State Bar No. 24083903
DECHERT LLP
500 W. 6th Street, Suite 2010
Austin, TX 78701
Telephone: (512) 394-3000
Facsimile: (512) 394-3001
lindsey.cohan@dechert.com