

NO. 06-35669

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

MUHAMMAD SHABAZZ FARRAKHAN, et al.,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

CHRISTINE O. GREGOIRE, et al.,

Defendants-Appellees.

ON APPEAL FROM THE
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SPOKANE

No. CV-96-076-RHW
The Honorable Robert H. Whaley
United States District Court Judge

BRIEF OF DEFENDANTS-APPELLEES

ROBERT M. MCKENNA
Attorney General

DANIEL J. JUDGE
Assistant Attorney General

JEFFREY T. EVEN
CAROL MURPHY
Deputy Solicitors General
PO Box 40100
Olympia, WA 98504-0100
(360) 664-9018

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	STATEMENT OF JURISDICTION.....	1
II.	STATEMENT OF ISSUES PRESENTED.....	1
III.	STATEMENT OF THE CASE.....	2
IV.	STATEMENT OF FACTS	4
	A. Plaintiffs' Background.....	4
	B. Washington's Felon Disenfranchisement Law.....	5
	C. Enactment Of The Voting Rights Act	7
V.	SUMMARY OF THE ARGUMENT	8
VI.	ARGUMENT	10
	A. The Voting Rights Act Does Not Apply To Felon Disenfranchisement Laws.....	10
	1. The Court Should Reexamine The Applicability Of The Voting Rights Act To Washington's Felon Disenfranchisement Law	10
	2. Congress Did Not Intend The Voting Rights Act To Apply To Felon Disenfranchisement Laws	12
	3. Constitutional Provisions And Principles Further Bolster The Conclusion That The Voting Rights Act Does Not Address Felon Disenfranchisement.....	18
	4. The Conclusion That Section 2 Of The Voting Rights Act Does Not Extend To Felon Disenfranchisement Does Not Eliminate Relief From Racial Discrimination	23
	B. The Plaintiffs Lack Standing To Claim Race Based Vote Denial Under Section 2 Of The Voting Rights Act	27
	C. Based On The Totality Of The Circumstances Test That Applies To Claims Under Section 2, The District Court Correctly Concluded That Plaintiffs Failed To Show That Washington's Felon Disenfranchisement Law Denies The Right To Vote Based On Race....	29

1. The Totality Of The Circumstances Test Requires Consideration Of All Relevant Factors.....	29
2. Plaintiffs' Evidence Of Racial Bias In Washington's Criminal Justice System Is Very Limited And, As A Matter of Law, Is Inadequate To Demonstrate That Even Senate Factor 5 Favors Plaintiffs' Claim	32
3. Even Fully Crediting Plaintiffs' Limited Evidence Of Racial Bias In Aspects Of Washington's Criminal Justice System, The Totality Of The Circumstances Test Strongly Supports The Conclusion That Washington's Felon Disenfranchisement Law Does Not Deny Individuals The Right To Vote On Account Of Race	38
a. Washington's Felon Disenfranchisement Law Readily Satisfies The Totality Of The Circumstances Test.....	38
b. No Authority Supports Ignoring Relevant Factors When Applying The Totality Of The Circumstances Test	41
c. The District Court Properly Determined That The Plaintiffs Did Not Show That Washington's Reason For Felon Disenfranchisement Is Tenuous.....	43
VII. CONCLUSION.....	45

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Bd. of Trustees of Univ. of Alabama v. Garrett</i> , 531 U.S. 356, 121 S. Ct. 955, 148 L. Ed. 2d 866 (2001)	21
<i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents</i> , 403 U.S. 388, 91 S. Ct. 1999, 29 L. Ed. 2d 619 (1971)	26
<i>Chisom v. Roemer</i> , 501 U.S. 380, 111 S. Ct. 2354, 115 L. Ed. 2d 348 (1991)	30
<i>City of Mobile v. Bolden</i> , 446 U.S. 55, 100 S. Ct. 1490, 64 L. Ed. 2d 47 (1980)	15
<i>Dominguez-Curry v. Nevada Transp. Dep't</i> , 424 F.3d 1027 (9th Cir. 2005)	33
<i>Duke Power Co. v. Carolina Env'tl. Study</i> , 438 U.S. 59, 98 S. Ct. 2620, 57 L. Ed. 2d 595 (1978)	28
<i>Edward J. DeBartolo Corp. v. Florida Gulf Coast Bldg. & Constr. Trades Council</i> , 485 U.S. 568, 108 S. Ct. 1392, 99 L. Ed. 2d 645 (1988)	18, 19, 23
<i>Farrakhan v. Locke</i> , 987 F. Supp. 1304 (E.D. Wash. 1997)	3, 24
<i>Farrakhan v. Washington</i> , 338 F.3d 1009 (9th Cir. 2003)	3, 10, 11, 32
<i>Farrakhan v. Washington</i> , 359 F.3d 1116 (9th Cir. 2004)	passim
<i>Flast v. Cohen</i> , 392 U.S. 83, 88 S. Ct. 1942, 20 L. Ed. 2d 947 (1968)	28
<i>Gomez v. City of Watsonville</i> , 863 F.2d 1407 (9th Cir. 1988)	42
<i>Gregory v. Ashcroft</i> , 501 U.S. 452, 111 S. Ct. 2395, 115 L. Ed. 2d 410 (1991)	21